The types of healthcare services available to patients in general may be divided into two categories – public and private hospitals. Mix-marketing element is a marketing approach that may be used to evaluate factors that affect patient tendency to choose one type of healthcare service. Aims: identify factors that affect patient tendency to choose public and private hospitals. This study implemented the Preferred report items for systematic reviews and meta-analysis (PRISMA) method. Literature search in PubMed and Google Scholar using the keywords mix-marketing element, private hospital, and public hospital resulted in six studies that use the mix-marketing element with a combination of the 7 P factors (7P), including Product, Price, Promotion, Place, People, Process, and Physical Evidence. One research found two categories of factors patient tendency to choose a hospital, including People and Product. Meanwhile, the second study showed the relationship between price and physical evidence with the tendency to choose public hospitals, whereas the tendency to choose private hospital is affected by product, place, promotion, and personnel. In general, the elements people, process, and healthcare services from the mix-marketing method affects patient tendency to choose both, public and private hospitals, though all seven factors in the mix-marketing method showed to influence the tendency to choose public and private hospitals.

**Keywords:** mix-marketing, mix-marketing element, private hospital, public hospital.

### INTRODUCTION

The development of technology and consumerism has colored various changes in the service industry, not excluding the healthcare industry. Customers use technology to obtain information, compare services before making a choice. Organizations in the healthcare industry have started to read this trend. Therefore, healthcare service organizations that do not follow this trend may be left behind in the competition. Development of private hospitals have increased, and competition also brings about a big change in the healthcare industry. Marketing of these services have slowly, but surely, become an important strategy that needs to be considered by hospitals to survive in the industry, especially in the private sector. The marketing strategy of private hospitals is to combine the marketing aims into one comprehensive plan. The best marketing strategy should be based on market research and focus on mix-marketing element to obtain maximum profit and maintain the business.

### LITERATURE REVIEW

According to Kotler (1996), marketing is the key to obtain organization aims to become more effective that competitors as it combines marketing activities to determine and fulfill the market’s wants and demands. Marketing management is an effort to improve the utilization of healthcare services, thus it may influence the degree of healthcare services.
provided. Various strategies have been used by hospital management to market their services. One well-known theory is the 7P mix-marketing method which includes Price (shown in Figure 1), Promotion, Physical Evidence, People, Process, Place, and Product. The mix-marketing method is a combination of 4 or more variables that form the center to a company marketing system. The 7P mix-marketing elements include: product, price, place, promotion, people, process and physical evidence (A brief summary of marketing and how it works, 2015).

(Devitra A, 2018)

**RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta Analysis (PRISMA) is an evidence-based method for systematic review.

**Data Source**

Articles in English that are relevant, published between 2010–2019 from 3 databases (EBSCOhost, Google Scholar, and Proquest). A combination of the terms used in the multi-field search, associated with mix-marketing and Public and Private Hospitals.

**Eligibility Criteria**

The inclusion criteria include research journal articles that include the relationship between mix marketing with Public and Private Hospitals. Studies that fulfill the criteria include the articles with full-text access published in English between 2010–2019. Research that fulfill the criteria starting from healthcare services were then narrowed down to public and private hospitals. Articles were not included if they do not fulfill the given criteria.

**Study Selection and Data Extraction**

The electronic database was reviewed for one week, starting from 1st – 7th December 2019 independently by the authors and was filtered collectively. The authors reviewed the title and abstracts of the studies found from the search engines to evaluate their eligibility for further review based on the inclusion criteria, and to choose the relevant articles for possible inclusion. Data extracted from the identified publications include author, publication year, study location. Findings from the studies were synthesized in a narrative synthesis of the research aims (Figure 2).

After review of the relevant topics and abstracts, 122 articles were identified. Review of full articles revealed 9 potential articles that fulfill the inclusion criteria and public access copies identified 3 articles to be excluded as full-text access were unavailable. There were 6 articles that fulfilled the eligibility criteria and were included in the review.

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

Ahmad, et al (2013) found that the multiple regression model which includes the mix marketing method have shown significant impact. The mix marketing, healthcare services, price, distribution, promotion, physical evidence, process, and strategy components of private hospitals has significant effects towards patient satisfaction. This research is based on the theoretical model and literature regarding service marketing in general, as well as specific healthcare service marketing, in addition to the mix marketing strategy components (healthcare services, price determination, distribution, promotion, physical evidence, process, and private strategy). Therefore, in the mix marketing strategy, hospital performance is measured by patient satisfaction. This research recommends hospital managers to focus on price and study the aims of price determination according to the needs and expectations of the patients. Hospitals should also learn regarding the distribution strategy by improving access to healthcare services. (Eddin et al., 2013).

Sreenivas, et al (2013) showed that to attain a successful healthcare service, professionalism in the organization is important. This helps the hospital in many ways, such as improving the organization potential to display specialties, have a strong base to serve. The primary and most important aim in marketing is to satisfy the customers by providing quality services. In the field of hospitals, it cannot be denied that medical services play an important role. If the physicians and nursing staff are polite, sympathetic, and kind to the patients, then time for
patient healing can be greatly minimized. Medical help surely plays an important role, but the supporting services also play a significant part, where without it, the length of stay may significantly increase. (T. Sreenivas, B. Srinivasara, 2013)

Results from Nitin, et al (2016) showed that there is a significant relationship between awareness of the concept of health and healthcare practice programs that is chosen by the hospital. It is noted that majority of tertiary healthcare centers have a low tendency to evaluate and determine mix marketing strategies. The hospital is recommended to determine micro schemes to improve bed occupancy rate (BOR), improve continuing medical education programs for the medical and nursing staff. (Nitin and Devakumar, 2016)

Inbasagaran, et al (2017), found that in 5 out of the 6 cases, hospital staff have provided rating for mix marketing with 7P and have shown that one of the factors play a significantly more important role. In association with this finding, the researcher established that the respondents with long-term ties to an organization can differentiate aspects of the organization better, compared to those with a short-term association to the organization. Hospital service performance such as comfort, dining facilities, care, work area, and time to discharge is important according to the patient. Two of the studied hospital have good performance and are able to satisfy their patients. Meanwhile, hospital staff opinion regarding the 7P indicators were variable. Both the hospitals were able to satisfy their patients with service promotions in the hospital and have opted the appropriate strategy. This proportion is proven by two aspects—the first is that comparison and analysis of the 7P implemented showed that it has been appropriately implemented, according to experts; second, survey reports show that patients agree with the 7P method implemented in both hospitals and that patients are satisfied. (N Inbasagaran, 2017)

Hosseini, et al (2016), showed that attendance of the doctors and nurses according to the given schedule, discipline, and speed of operation, as well as effective personnel significantly affect patient tendency to choose a type of healthcare service. This is consistent with other research results. Considering the finding that for private hospitals, there are 10 factors that highly affect patient tendency to choose this healthcare service, including politeness, respect, and appropriate attitude of the staff, and attendance of the physicians and nurses according to the given time (people); sophisticated equipment and good supporting services (physical evidence); discipline and speed of surgery, providing careful services, and shorter waiting times (process); efficiency, effectiveness; and quality of services provided (productivity and quality). (Seyed Mojtaba Hosseini, Samira Etesaminia, no date)

Abedighasem, et al (2018) found that the level of trust to the mix marketing elements differ between public and private hospitals, though the relationship is significant. This research showed that the primary reason patients choose a public hospital is price, whereas the product factor highly influences the choice of a private hospital. This is in-line with other research which has shown that: (Abedighasem, Ehsanabedini, Faridehrostami, 2018)

1. Products/services is the first important step in developing services that fulfill expectations
2. The patient’s economic condition influences the choice of healthcare services
3. The type of hospital is the lowest influencer of patient’s tendency to choose a type of healthcare service

In reality, not all elements of the mix marketing approach always influence patient services in a hospital. This is highly dependent on the internal and external conditions of the public and private hospitals. It is found in all the research above that people, process, and healthcare service elements of the mix-marketing method influences patient services in the public sector and in private hospitals.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Conclusion

The marketing mix model is a tool, primarily used to improve patient tendency to choose a specific type of healthcare service and play an important role in building a positive illustration in the patient minds if
used carefully and planned systematically and responsibly. (Seyed Mojtaba Hosseini, Samira Etesaminia, no date).

Currently, the field of healthcare is a very important one that is booming. It is the responsibility of the manager/administrator to create an image of the hospital as one that provides quality healthcare services with affordable prices. If more patients come to the hospital, it will proportionally increase the hospital’s income. This may be effectively reached by formulating the hospital’s mix marketing strategy and the best services offered by the hospital.

A good mix marketing strategy is one that ensures the services provided by the hospital satisfies the consumers hospitals should not only concentrate on providing medical assistance, but should also consider other aspects of the mix marketing strategy attributed to the 7P, such as environment, affordability, cleanliness, soft skills of the staff, etc. The mix marketing strategy plays a vital role in drawing in customers/patients without economic considerations to successfully access the services provided by the hospital. (Nitin and Devakumar, 2016).

The research identified that hospital awareness, including the medical and administrative staff, is a key component in the marketing of hospitals. Staff are part of the people strategy and they play an enormous role in influencing the community, the users of healthcare services, to visit a specific hospital to obtain the desired services. Unfortunately, not all hospital staff are aware that they play an important role in the marketing of the hospital, private sector/hospital, based on the journals previously reviewed which showed that staff are an important part of marketing, though with time, public hospitals are beginning to implement staff as a marketing tool for their services.

Therefore, not all elements of the mix marketing strategy influence patient services in the public hospital as it is highly dependent on the internal and external factors of both, public and private hospitals. However, the research shows that the people, process, and healthcare service elements of this mix marketing method influences patient services in the public sector and in private hospitals.

By following a comprehensive marketing strategy in hospital services, we are able to lay a foundation that is strong for both medical facilities that is good and with a private touch with regard to patient services. This also directs the hospital to provide quality and affordable services. The marketing strategy should focus on the provision of medical services, even for the segment of the community that are not in the position to pay for the services, that is hospitals should provide quick and quality medical services with affordable prices. (N Infasagaran, 2017)

**Recommendations**

Hospitals should prepare a yearly marketing plan to prepare for the future. While preparing this plan, the organization mission statement and aims should be considered and a plan to be implemented must be prepared. The hospital should understand what they would like to communicate or the targets to be reached for their audience to understand or remember, or the foundations of the hospital itself. This is an important part of the marketing plan. This provides the much-needed direction for the marketing efforts and reaches a farther consequence. Based on the description given, the recommendation is to prepare a strategic marketing plan involving stakeholders of the hospital, such that an appropriate strategy may be determined for future marketing efforts within the next 3 to 5 years, based on the institution policies, in this case, the hospital. Primary aim of the strategic plan is to attain the vision set by the hospital.

**REFERENCES**


## Table 1. Research Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author/Year of Publication</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Research Aims</th>
<th>Methods</th>
<th>Influence of mix marketing on private hospitals</th>
<th>Influence of mix marketing on public hospitals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ala'Eddin Mohammad Khalaf Ahmad, Abdullah Ali Al-Qarni, Omar Zayyan Alsharqi, Dalia Abdullah Qalai dan Najla Kadi 2013</td>
<td>The Impact of marketing Mix Strategy on Hospitals Performance Measured by Patient Satisfaction: An Empirical Investigation on Jeddah Private Sector Hospital Senior Managers Perspective</td>
<td>To develop a conceptual work frame aimed at identifying the mix marketing strategy components that influence patient satisfaction in hospitals within the private sector of Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>Purpose Sampling</td>
<td>Healthcare services, price, distribution, promotion, physical evidence, and private hospital strategy significantly affects patient satisfaction. 5 out of 7 mix marketing strategy components have a positive correlation that is significant to hospital performance as measured by patient satisfaction, showing the impact of mix marketing strategy on hospital performance, as measured by patient satisfaction. Pearson correlation varied between (0.520 – 0.217), positively correlated between all 5 items of the mix marketing strategy to be significant (p &lt;0.05)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dr. T. Sreenivas, dr. B. Srinivasa Rao, dr. U. Srinivasa Rao 2013</td>
<td>An Analysis On Marketing Mix In Hospital</td>
<td>To recommend appropriate steps for effective marketing from private hospital services in general, and specifically in India</td>
<td>Mix Method</td>
<td>Price, place, promotion, people, process, physical evidence, and service facility. The most dominant variable is staff, including physicians, nursing staff, and administrative personnel.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author/Year of Publication</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Research Aims</td>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>Influence of mix marketing on private hospitals</td>
<td>Influence of mix marketing on public hospitals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nitin RV, Narendranath V,</td>
<td>An Empirical Study On Marketing Mix Strategies On Health Care Services</td>
<td>Empirical study mix marketing strategies in healthcare services in a tertiary</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Service facility, price, medical program, process, physical evidence, promotion, people. There is a significant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devakumar G 2016</td>
<td>In A Tertiary Care Hospital</td>
<td>facility in Chitrudurga (India)</td>
<td></td>
<td>relationship between awareness of healthcare concepts and health practice programs chosen by the hospital.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N Inbasagaran, R Chandrasekaran 2018</td>
<td>Marketing Strategies Of Private Hospitals In Coimbatore And Its Consequences</td>
<td>To study and evaluate effectiveness of the marketing strategy implemented by chosen private hospitals and its consequences. All this easily classified into seven primary strategies or 7P, including product/services, price, place, promotion, people, physical evidence, and process.</td>
<td>Explorative survey method</td>
<td>Product/services, price, place, people, physical evidence, and process.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Politeness, respect, and attitude of the staff, attendance of physician and nursing staff according to the given schedule (people), sophisticated equipment and good supporting services (physical evidence); discipline and speed of surgery, careful provision of services, and shorter waiting times (process); efficiency; effectiveness; and quality of services provided (product and quality).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author/Year of Publication</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Research Aims</td>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>Influence of mix marketing on private hospitals</td>
<td>Influence of mix marketing on public hospitals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abedighasem, Ehsanabedini, Faridehrostami, Aliasgharnad</td>
<td>Patients’ tendency to the public and private hospitals (Case study) The influence of marketing mix elements (7Ps) on patient tendency to visit public and private hospitals.</td>
<td>This research aimed at evaluating the influence of marketing elements (7Ps) on patient tendency to visit public and private hospitals.</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>This research showed that the primary reason patients choose private hospitals is product.</td>
<td>This research showed that the primary reason patients choose a public hospital is price, whereas the product factor highly influences the choice of a private hospital. This is in-line with other research which has shown that: 1. Products/services is the first important step in developing services that fulfill expectations 2. The patient’s economic condition influences the choice of healthcare services 3. The type of hospital is the lowest influencer of patient’s tendency to choose a type of healthcare service</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 1. “7P Marketing Mix”
(Source: Talisman, 2019)

Figure 2. Narrative Synthesis of Research Aims